Hon Kiri Allan

Minister of Justice

Proactive release: Electoral (Māori Electoral Option) Legislation Bill – Supplementary Order Paper

Date of issue: 09 January 2023

The following documents have been proactively released in accordance with Cabinet Office Circular CO (18) 4.

Some information has been withheld on the basis that it would not, if requested under the Official Information Act 1982 (OIA), be released. Where that is the case, the relevant section of the OIA has been noted and no public interest has been identified that would outweigh the reasons for withholding it.

No.	Document	Comments		
1.	Electoral (Māori Electoral Option) Legislation Bill – Supplementary Order Paper Cabinet Paper Office of the Minister of Justice 10 November 2022	Some information has been withheld in accordance with the following section of the OIA: • Section 9(2)(f)(iv) to maintain the constitutional conventions for the time being which protects the confidentiality of advice tendered by Ministers of the Crown and officials.		
2.	Electoral (Māori Electoral Option) Legislation Bill – Supplementary Order Paper Cabinet Minute LEG-22-MIN-0194 Cabinet Office 10 November 2022	Some information has been withheld in accordance with the following section of the OIA: • Section 9(2)(f)(iv) to maintain the constitutional conventions for the time being which protects the confidentiality of advice tendered by Ministers of the Crown and officials.		

In Confidence

Office of the Minister of Justice
Chair, Cabinet Legislation Committee

Electoral (Māori Electoral Option) Legislation Bill - Supplementary Order Paper

Proposal

This paper seeks approval for potential amendments to the Electoral (Māori Electoral Option) Legislation Bill (the Bill) to be made through a Supplementary Order Paper (SOP).

Relation to government priorities

This paper reflects the Government's commitment to working to honour te Tiriti o Waitangi / the Treaty of Waitangi and to protect the integrity of New Zealand elections, and voters' access to the polls.

Background

The Bill makes changes to encourage Māori participation in elections

- The Bill, in its current form, replaces the 4-month period for the Māori Electoral Option with a continuous option model. This model gives Māori voters the option of changing rolls at any time and without restriction as to the number of times they can change.
- There is one exception in the current Bill, in which Māori voters will not be able to change roll type into the electorate during the period of a parliamentary by-election for either a general or Māori electorate in which an elector resides or to which they move. The exception period for by-elections in the Bill is triggered by the gazetting of the vacancy, as required under the Electoral Act 1993 (the Act) and ends on polling day. It is approximately 8 weeks long.¹
- The by-election exception was included in recognition of the narrower focus of by-elections (compared to general elections), when a small pool of voters is focused on a single electoral outcome. The exception also follows the general principle that the voters for a by-election are expected to be largely the same population who voted in that electorate at the previous general election.
- 6 Clause 5 of the Bill makes consequential amendments to section 35 of the Act to reflect the move to a continuous option. In particular it provides the new date upon which the Electoral Commission must provide the Government Statistician with the required information to enable the Government Statistician to calculate

¹ Existing provisions in the Electoral Act prevent any changes to the roll (which will include transfers between rolls) in the period between a polling day and the return of the writ for that election, to ensure the integrity of the official count. This period is approximately 3 weeks.

the Māori electoral population under a continuous option. It is not possible to introduce a continuous option without amending section 35.

Section 35 is a reserved provision and amending it may require a 75% majority vote

7 Section 35 is a reserved provision under the Act (section 268(1)(c)). Any substantive amendments to that section require the agreement of 75% of all Members of the House (or a referendum) before it can be amended.

8	Section (9)(2)(f)(iv)

The Bill as reported back from the Justice Committee includes differing views from the National Party and ACT.

- 9 The Bill was reported back from the Justice Committee on 1 November 2022. The Committee recommended that the Bill be passed by majority, with some minor technical amendments.
- The New Zealand National Party, in its differing view, noted that the Bill precludes roll switching during a by-election period, which mitigated against the risk of tactical roll switching. It raised concerns that the Bill did not include an equivalent prohibition in relation to the period around general elections. It further noted the desirability of bipartisan support for electoral law changes, and its disappointment that the Government had not sought to accommodate its concerns on this point.
- ACT New Zealand, in its differing view, supported the intention of the Bill to enable Māori voters greater flexibility to change electoral rolls but considered that voters should only be able to do so once within an electoral cycle. It did not indicate any view on whether voters should be able to transfer rolls in the pre-election period.

Approvals sought for a three-month pre-election exception period

- 12 I believe that, wherever possible, changes to the voting system are best progressed on a bipartisan basis.
- On Tuesday 25 October 2022, Cabinet agreed to enable the preparation of a SOP to amend the Bill so that Māori voters are unable to switch rolls in the period immediately prior to a general election. This will help address the concerns raised that allowing Māori voters to switch rolls up until the close of polls provides them with an electoral advantage, particularly in electorate seats where the margins between candidates are small.
- 14 Cabinet also gave me authorisation to decide the appropriate length for the new exception period, after further engagement with the National Party. I have received advice from officials on two potential approaches to setting the pre-

- election exception period. I have also received advice from the Electoral Commission on the operational implications of the two approaches.
- The first option would provide for an exception period of a set number of weeks or months prior to polling day. The second would provide for a much shorter exception period of approximately five weeks, following the closing of the rolls on Writ day.

I propose a three-month exception period to mitigate any risk of tactical voting

- I have discussed this SOP with the National Party Justice Spokesperson, who has indicated in-principle support pending caucus discussions, and I have decided that the exception period should commence **three months** before polling day. In due course I intend to send letters to the National Party, and Justice spokespeople from other parliamentary parties, to formally seek support for the SOP.
- I consider a three-month exception period will best mitigate any risk, or perceived risk, of tactical voting, providing sufficient time and distance from the voting period itself. The three months leading up to a general election are traditionally when parties and candidates begin stepping up their electoral campaigns, and voters start turning their attention more towards their upcoming electoral choice. A three-month period also aligns with the 'regulated period' for election advertising, during which there are tighter rules and restrictions around election advertising expenditure and disclosure of such expenditure.
- I note that if a parliamentary by-election is held in earlier part of the same year in which the general election is held, the two exception periods could cumulatively mean that Māori voters in some areas are unable to change rolls for approximately six months in that year.²

Provision will be made for times when a three-month exception period is not possible

- Although the convention of Prime Ministers in the last few elections has been to announce the date of the election early in the start of the election year, there is no statutory requirement for when this announcement must be made. Therefore, provision would need to be made for circumstances when a three-month exception period is not possible. Although these circumstances arise only rarely, they will need to be addressed in the SOP.
- 20 In these situations, I propose the following:
 - 20.1 Where a three-month period is not possible for example, an early or snap election has been called and there is less than three months between the announcement of the election and polling day the exception period will be the period beginning on the day after the date on which the polling day is announced and ending on polling day;²
 - 20.2 If the Prime Minister announces a change in polling date after the exception period has already begun and the new date that is **less than**

² See footnote 1

- three months away, the existing exception period prior to the new announcement would be extended to end on the new polling day;²
- 20.3 If the Prime Minister announces a change in polling date after the exception period has already begun and the new date that is **more than** three months away:
 - any existing exception period already underway would still be valid, but would end on the day of the Prime Minister's announcement; and
 - a new exception period would begin three months before the new polling day,² under the standard rules.
- In a worst-case scenario, the proposals in paragraphs 20.2 and 20.3 could result in Māori voters being unable to change rolls for around 4 or 5 months the year in which a general election is held.

A three-month exception period will require changes to the Commission's enrolment update campaigns

- Currently under the Act, the Electoral Commission (the Commission) must notify all electors of their enrolment details. It does this as part of its 'enrolment update campaign'. The enrolment update campaign starts approximately three months before the general election, in order to ensure the rolls are as up to date as possible when they are closed off on writ day.
- The Bill includes a new provision requiring the Commission to inform Māori voters whether they are enrolled on the Māori or General roll, that they are entitled to change rolls, and provide information about the differences between the two types of rolls. Under the continuous option the Bill requires the Commission to include this information as part of its standard enrolment update campaign before a general election and the triennial local elections.
- However, with the introduction of a three-month exception period, the Commission would need to send out a separate notification to Māori voters at least three months prior to the beginning of the exception period, where practicable, in order to give them time to change rolls. The Bill will need to be amended to provide for this additional notification. This will increase the Commission's costs (see 'financial implications' below).

I have considered, but do not propose, a shorter exception period starting on writ day

- I also received advice from Ministry officials on an exception period starting when the rolls are closed off, which occurs on the same day as the Writ is issued (being no later than seven days after the dissolution or expiration of Parliament). This is similar to the approach to the current exception period for by-elections in the Bill, which is triggered by the gazetting of the vacancy, as required under the Act.
- The issuing of the Writ is the formal statutory event that triggers the election. Therefore, it would not require any special provisions to address the

- circumstances of an early or 'snap' election, or a change in polling date after the exception period has begun.
- Writ day is relatively well publicised and transparent for all electoral participants. It is also the same day that the rolls are closed for publishing. From an enrolment perspective, this option aligns with the period of the Commission's pre-election enrolment campaign, as writ day is the date by which the Commission strongly encourages all voters to enrol or update their enrolment details, so they can vote more easily using an 'ordinary vote'.³
- However, triggering the exception from writ day would mean the exception period would only be approximately five weeks prior to polling day. I consider this still leaves open the risk of tactical roll switching for the majority of the period when parties' and candidates' election campaigning intensifies in the lead up to the election. I also do not believe that this option could attract support from the National Party.

I propose a similar exception period for local triennial elections

- On 25 October 2022, Cabinet also noted that I would consult with the Minister for Local Government on whether an exception period should also be introduced prior to polling day for triennial local elections.
- I have discussed this matter with the Minister of Local Government, and we propose a similar exception period prior to polling day for triennial local elections to reflect that the risk of tactical voting in local elections is of equally significant concern. It is also preferable that the provisions governing local elections and general elections should be aligned as much as possible to reduce voter confusion.
- In order to best align with the general election provision, and increase the likelihood of bipartisan support, we propose that the Bill is amended so that Māori voters are unable to change rolls for local triennial elections in the three months prior to polling day. Aligning triennial local elections with general elections will provide consistency and reduce the potential risk of tactical voting across the board.
- This will add a third period within the parliamentary electoral cycle where Māori voters cannot change rolls, along with the current exception for parliamentary by-elections and the proposed exception for general elections. If a parliamentary by-election is held in earlier part of the year in which the triennial local elections is held, the two exception periods could cumulatively mean that Māori voters in some areas are unable to change rolls for approximately five to six months in that year.⁴

5

³ Anyone who enrols or updates their enrolment details after writ day must vote via a special vote, which takes a significantly longer time to cast and count.

⁴ For example, had these rules been in place in 2022, some Māori voters living in, or moving to, the Tauranga electorate area would have been unable to change from the Māori to the general roll for that electorate due to the parliamentary by-election exception from 9 May 2022, when the notice of vacancy

This change means that the existing exception in the Bill, which allowed for Māori voters to change rolls in the lead up to a local election, even if it coincides with a parliamentary by-election exception period, can be removed.

The Commission will need to send an enrolment update notification to Māori voters three months prior to the start of the exception period

- For local elections there are some different processes around encouraging voters to correct their enrolment information. For example, three months before polling day councils and local electoral officers start a process to encourage people to check that their enrolment details are correct. This is referred to as the inspection of the roll, and under the Local Electoral Act 2001 must last for at least 28 days before the roll is closed.
- The Bill as introduced allowed voters of Māori descent to switch rolls during that period. The amendment in the SOP will prevent this.
- Currently the Commission delivers an 'enrolment update campaign' prior to each local election. This usually runs in early July of the local election year, as it is timed to coincide with the 28-day 'inspection of the rolls'.
- 37 However, the Minister of Local Government and I agree that a consistent 3month exception period for both parliamentary and local elections will best promote electoral integrity and support public understanding of election processes.
- Instead, an earlier period will be set aside for Māori voters to be informed of and to exercise their ability to change rolls up to the 3-month exception period. This will mean the Commission would need to send out a separate notification to Māori voters at least three months prior to the beginning of the exception period, in order to give them time to change rolls. The Bill will need to be amended to provide for this additional notification. This will further increase the Commission's costs (see 'financial implications' below).

Financial implications

There will be an ongoing increase in the Commission's costs, as it will now be required to undertake four national enrolment-related campaigns each electoral cycle instead of two. For the changed Māori Electoral Option, the Commission will need to do an additional separate mail-out and prepare a separate information programme and enrolment outreach for each parliamentary and local general election to ensure Māori voters are aware of the option and the relevant exception period and have sufficient opportunity to make the choice in time. This is in addition to the enrolment update campaigns for each event, which occur after the 3-month exception is in effect.

was issued, until polling day on 18 June. They also could not change rolls between 18 June to 7 July 2022 when the writ for that by-election was returned while the official count is being completed. They would then have been unable to change rolls again from 8 July 2022 through to 8 October 2022 under the local election exception period.

The Electoral Commission has advised that funding available to inform electors

	include the communications required for the new exception period for the 2023 election.
41	Section (9)(2)(f)(iv) the timing of the proposed exception period means that the significant enrolment update campaign that takes place is no longer a suitable vehicle for raising awareness. The cost savings that can be made by using that campaign are no longer available.
42	Section (9)(2)(f)(iv)
43	Section (9)(2)(f)(iv)
44	Section (9)(2)(f)(iv)
	_

Impact Analysis

40

Regulatory Impact Statement

- A Regulatory Impact Statement (RIS) was prepared in accordance with Cabinet's impact analysis requirements and was submitted at the time Cabinet approval was sought on policy related to the Electoral (Māori Electoral Option) Legislation Bill (SWC-21-MIN-0181 and CAB-21-MIN-0490 refer).
- A supplementary RIS has been produced to reflect policy proposals to introduce a pre-election exception period for parliamentary and triennial local elections, as outlined in this Cabinet paper. This is attached in appendix 1.
- The Ministry of Justice's Regulatory Impact Assessment quality panel has reviewed the RIS: Timing and frequency of the Māori Electoral Option Updated with Supplementary Annex: Supplementary Order Paper to the Electoral (Māori Electoral Option) Legislation Bill. The panel considers that the information and analysis summarised in the Supplementary Annex partially meets the Quality Assurance criteria.

- The Supplementary Annex, when read together with the Regulatory Impact Statement: Timing and frequency of the Māori Electoral Option, clearly and concisely describes the regulatory framework and concerns around the possibility of tactical voting under the new continuous enrolment option. The issue being considered and analysed in the RIS was identified through Ministry of Justice targeted consultation and the Select Committee submission process.
- However, the analysis has been constrained by the pace at which these options have been developed and the inability to test them in further consultation. The RIS clearly identifies officials' preferred options with supporting analysis and the differing weightings and judgements that could lead to alternative options being preferred. Limitations and constraints on the analysis are clearly set out in the Supplementary Annex.

Climate Implications of Policy Assessment

The Climate Implications of Policy Assessment (CIPA) requirements do not apply to this proposal as the threshold for significance is not met.

Compliance

- 51 The SOP complies with:
 - 51.1 the principles of Te Tiriti o Waitangi / the Treaty of Waitangi;
 - 51.2 advice from the Treaty Provisions Officials Group on any Treaty of Waitangi provisions (include a summary of any concerns raised) (N/A);
 - 51.3 the rights and freedoms contained in the New Zealand Bill of Rights Act 1990 and the Human Rights Act 1993;
 - 51.4 the disclosure statement requirements (a supplementary disclosure statement prepared by the Ministry of Justice is attached);
 - 51.5 the principles and guidelines set out in the Privacy Act 2020;
 - 51.6 relevant international standards and obligations; and
 - 51.7 the Legislation Guidelines (2021 edition), which are maintained by the Legislation Design and Advisory Committee.

Consultation

The Department of Internal Affairs, the Treasury, the Electoral Commission, Statistics New Zealand and the Department of Prime Minister and Cabinet have been consulted on this paper.

Binding on the Crown

- Cabinet Circular (02) 4: Acts Binding the Crown: Procedures for Cabinet Decision notes that bills that are amending existing Acts will generally follow the position of the principal Act on whether the Act is binding on the Crown.
- The Electoral Act 1993 does not bind the Crown and Cabinet agreed the Bill will follow that position [LEG-22-MIN-0064]. The SOP will not bind the Crown in relation to amendments to the Electoral Act.

The Local Electoral Act 2001 binds the Crown and Cabinet agreed that the Bill will bind the Crown in relation to this Act [LEG-22-MIN-0064]. The SOP will bind the Crown in relation to amendments to the Local Electoral Act.

Creating new agencies or amending law relating to existing agencies

The amendments do not create any new agencies.

Allocation of decision-making powers

57 The amendments do not allocate decision making powers between the executive and judiciary.

Associated regulations

The amendments do not amend any regulations.

Other instruments

The amendments do not include any provision empowering the making of other instruments deemed to be legislative instruments or disallowable instruments.

Definition of Minister/department

The amendments do not contain a definition of Minister, Department or Chief Executive of a department.

Commencement of legislation

The amendments will come into force on 31 March 2023, in accordance with other provisions of the Bill.

Parliamentary stages

- The Electoral (Māori Electoral Option) Legislation Bill was introduced on 21 June 2022 and received its first reading on 30 June 2022. The Bill is currently scheduled for second reading on 8 November 2022.
- The SOP is expected to be tabled in the House on 15 November 2022 for consideration by the Committee of the Whole House.

Publicity

I intend to issue a media release relating to this package of electoral reforms following Royal assent.

Proactive Release

I propose to release this Cabinet paper and related Minute with any necessary redactions in accordance with Cabinet Office Circular CO (18) 4, following the tabling of the SOP in the House.

Recommendations

The Minister of Justice recommends that the Committee:

- note that the Electoral (Māori Electoral Option) Legislation Bill (the Bill) replaces the four-month period for the Māori Electoral Option with a continuous option model;
- 2 **note** that the Bill amends section 35, a reserved provision under the Electoral Act (the Act), which if triggered requires the agreement of 75% of all Members of the House to amend;
- note that on 25 October 2022 Cabinet agreed to enable the preparation of a Supplementary Order Paper to amend the Bill so that Māori voters are unable to switch rolls in the period immediately prior to a general Section (9)(2)(f)(iv)
- 4 **note** that Cabinet authorised me to decide the appropriate length for the new exception period, after engagement with the National Party;
- 5 **note** that where possible, changes to the voting system should be progressed on as much of a bipartisan basis as possible;

Parliamentary general elections

- 6 **note** that I have consulted with the National Party, and have decided on a threemonth exception period immediately prior to polling day for a parliamentary general election;
- 7 agree that Section (9)(2)(f)(iv) a three-month exception period should be added to the Bill in order to attain bipartisan support;
- 8 **agree** that the exception will have the following features:
 - 8.1 where a three-month period is not possible for example an early or snap election has been called the exception period will be the period beginning on the day after the date on which the polling day is announced and ending on polling day;
 - 8.2 if the Prime Minister announces a change in polling date after the exception period has already begun and that announcement is of a new date that is **less than** three months away, the existing exception period prior to the new announcement would be extended to end on the new polling day (which could result in an exception period of around 4-5 months);
 - 8.3 if the Prime Minister announces a change in polling date after the exception period has already begun and that announcement is of a new date that is **more than** three months away:
 - any existing exception period already underway would still be valid, but would end on the day of the Prime Minister's announcement; and

- a new exception period would begin three months before the new polling day, under the standard rules;
- 8.4 if practicable, the Electoral Commission will be required to send out notification of enrolment details at least three months prior to the beginning of the exception period, in order to give Māori voters time to change rolls;

Local elections

- 9 note that I have consulted with the Minister for Local Government on whether an exception period should also be introduced prior to polling day for triennial local elections:
- agree to amend the Bill so that Māori voters are unable to switch rolls in the three months immediately prior to a triennial local general election;
- agree that the Electoral Commission will be required to send out notification of enrolment details at least three months prior to the beginning of the exception period, in order to give to Māori voters time to change rolls;

Other matters

12	Section (9)(2)(f)(iv)		^	
		-		
			-	

- authorise the Minister of Justice to make minor and consequential policy decisions that may arise before the SOP is introduced, in conjunction with the Minister of Local Government in respect of any local electoral matters, and to update the draft SOP accordingly;
- agree that Parliamentary Counsel Office can make amendments to the new exception SOP to in relation to minor and technical drafting matters; and
- approve the tabling of the Supplementary Order Paper to the Bill in the House of Representatives at the Committee of whole House stage.

Authorised for lodgement

Hon Kiri Allan Minister of Justice



Cabinet Legislation Committee

Minute of Decision

This document contains information for the New Zealand Cabinet. It must be treated in confidence and handled in accordance with any security classification, or other endorsement. The information can only be released, including under the Official Information Act 1982, by persons with the appropriate authority.

Electoral (Māori Electoral Option) Legislation Bill: Supplementary Order Paper

Portfolio Justice

On 10 November 2022, the Cabinet Legislation Committee:

- noted that the Electoral (Māori Electoral Option) Legislation Bill (the Bill) replaces the four-month period for the Māori Electoral Option with a continuous option model;
- 2 **noted** that the Bill amends section 35, a reserved provision under the Electoral Act (the Act), which if triggered requires the agreement of 75% of all Members of the House to amend;
- noted that on 25 October 2022, Cabinet agreed to enable the preparation of a Supplementary Order Paper to amend the Bill so that Māori voters are unable to switch rolls in the period immediately prior to a general election, Section (9)(2)(f)(iv)

 [CAB-22-MIN-0472];
- 4 **noted** that Cabinet authorised the Minister of Justice to decide the appropriate length for the new exception period, after engagement with the National Party;
- **noted** that where possible, changes to the voting system should be progressed on as much of a bipartisan basis as possible;

Parliamentary general elections

- 6 **noted** that the Minister of Justice has consulted with the National Party, and has decided on a three-month exception period immediately prior to polling day for a parliamentary general election;
- 7 **agreed** Section (9)(2)(f)(iv) , a three-month exception period should be added to the Bill in order to attain bipartisan support;
- 8 **agreed** that the exception will have the following features:
 - 8.1 where a three-month period is not possible for example an early or snap election has been called the exception period will be the period beginning on the day after the date on which the polling day is announced and ending on polling day;
 - 8.2 if the Prime Minister announces a change in polling date after the exception period has already begun and that announcement is of a new date that is less than three months away, the existing exception period prior to the new announcement would be extended to end on the new polling day (which could result in an exception period of around 4-5 months);

- 8.3 if the Prime Minister announces a change in polling date after the exception period has already begun and that announcement is of a new date that is more than three months away:
 - any existing exception period already underway would still be valid, but would end on the day of the Prime Minister's announcement;
 - a new exception period would begin three months before the new polling day, under the standard rules;
- 8.4 if practicable, the Electoral Commission will be required to send out notification of enrolment details at least three months prior to the beginning of the exception period, in order to give Māori voters time to change rolls;

Local elections

- 9 noted that the Minister of Justice has consulted with the Minister for Local Government on whether an exception period should also be introduced prior to polling day for triennial local elections;
- agreed to amend the Bill so that Māori voters are unable to switch rolls in the three months immediately prior to a triennial local general election;
- agreed that the Electoral Commission will be required to send out notification of enrolment details at least three months prior to the beginning of the exception period, in order to give to Māori voters time to change rolls;

Other Matters

- noted that the Electoral Commission will incur increased costs from the need to undertake four national enrolment-related campaigns each electoral cycle, Section (9)(2)(f)(iv)
- authorised the Minister of Justice to make minor and consequential policy decisions that may arise before the SOP is introduced, in conjunction with the Minister of Local Government in respect of any local electoral matters, and to update the draft SOP accordingly;
- authorised Parliamentary Counsel Office to make minor and technical amendments to the SOP that may arise during drafting;
- approved the Supplementary Order Paper to the Electoral (Māori Electoral Option)
 Legislation Bill [PCO 21160-3/7.0] for release prior to the Committee of the Whole House stage for the Bill.

Rebecca Davies Committee Secretary

Present:

Hon Megan Woods

Hon Chris Hipkins (Chair)

Hon Andrew Little

Hon David Parker

Hon Nanaia Mahuta

Hon Michael Wood

Hon Kiri Allan

Hon Dr David Clark

Hon Priyanca Radhakrishnan

Hon Kieran McAnulty

Dr Duncan Webb, MP

Officials present from:

Office of the Prime Minister Officials Committee for LEG